Reforming the International Financial System

Crisis Prevention and Response

Edited by Jan Joost Teunissen

> FONDAD The Hague

From: Reforming the International Financial System: Crisis Prevention and Response, FONDAD, December 2000, www.fondad.org

Forum on Debt and Development (FONDAD)

FONDAD is an independent policy research centre and forum for international discussion established in the Netherlands. Supported by a worldwide network of experts, it provides policy-oriented research on a range of North-South problems, with particular emphasis on international financial issues. Through research, seminars and publications, FONDAD aims to provide factual back-ground information and practical strategies for policymakers and other interested groups in industrial, developing and transition countries.

Director: Jan Joost Teunissen

Reforming the International Financial System: Crisis Prevention and Response

Proceedings of a Conference on "Crisis Prevention and Response: Where Do We Stand with the Debate on the Reform of the International Financial Architecture?", held at the Dutch Ministry of Foreign Affairs on 26-27 June 2000 and organised by the Forum on Debt and Development in the context of the Global Financial Governance Initiative, with the co-sponsorship of the Dutch Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Dutch Ministry of Finance, IDRC, ECLAC, the Commonwealth Secretariat, the International Monetary Fund, and UNCTAD.

Editor: Jan Joost Teunissen

The views expressed in this book do not necessarily represent those of the Forum on Debt and Development or any of the co-sponsors. The summaries of the floor discussions, following the papers, attempt to convey the sense and substance of what was discussed. They have not been reviewed by all of the participants.

ISBN: 90-74208-17-7

Copyright: Forum on Debt and Development (FONDAD), 2000.

Permission must be obtained from FONDAD prior to any further reprints, republication, photocopying, or other use of this work.

This publication was made possible thanks to the support of the Department for Development Cooperation of the Dutch Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Additional copies may be ordered from FONDAD at Noordeinde 107 A, 2514 GE The Hague, the Netherlands Tel: 31-70-3653820 Fax: 31-70-3463939 E-Mail: info@fondad.org

Contents

Π

Acknowledgements	7
Notes on the Contributors	8
Abbreviations	14
Preface by José Antonio Ocampo	17
Introduction by Jan Joost Teunissen	21

I Positive and Negative Aspects of Recent Reform Proposals

"Facing the Volatility and Concentration of Capital Flows" Stephany Griffith-Jones and José Antonio Ocampo	31
Comment by Wouter Raab	64
"Reforming the International Financial System: Prospects for Regional Financial Cooperation in East Asia" <i>Yung Chul Park and Yunjong Wang</i>	70
Comment by Louis Kasekende	84
Floor Discussion	88
A New Framework for Private Sector Involvement in Crisis Prevention and Crisis Management	
"A New Framework for Private Sector Involvement in Crisis Prevention and Crisis Management" Jack Boorman and Mark Allen	101
Comment by Maria Ramos	124

Floor Discussion	128
Floor Discussion	128

III Recent Initiatives to Improve the Regulation and Supervision of Private Capital Flows

"Recent Initiatives to Improve the Regulation and Supervision of Private Capital Flows" <i>William R. White</i>	141
Comment by Guillermo Le Fort	159
"On Financial Instability and Control" <i>Yilmaz Akyüz</i>	164
Comment by Amar Bhattacharya	178
Floor Discussion	183

IV Reforming the IMF

"The Future Role of the IMF: A Developing Country Point of View" <i>Aziz Ali Mohammed</i>	193
Comment by Howard Brown Comment by Ariel Buira	210 213
Floor Discussion	218
Appendix: List of Participants	223

Acknowledgements

This book was made possible through the ideas, support and contributions of many people and organisations. A particular thanks goes to the participants of the June 2000 conference, held in The Hague, from which this book emerges.

Fondad very much appreciates the continuing support of the Dutch Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the co-sponsoring of this conference by the Dutch Ministry of Finance, IDRC, ECLAC, the Commonwealth Secretariat, the International Monetary Fund, and UNCTAD.

A special thanks goes to Adriana Bulnes, Naomi Leefmans and Robert Ovetz who assisted me in the publishing of this book.

Jan Joost Teunissen

Notes on the Contributors

Yilmaz Akyüz (1943) is Acting Director, Division on Globalization and Development Strategies at UNCTAD. He is the principle author and head of the team preparing the *Trade and Development Report* and UNCTAD coordinator of the substantive support to the G-24 in the IMF and World Bank on International Monetary and Financial Issues. He has successively worked as Inspector of Finance in Turkey and as Professor of Economics at the Faculty of Political Sciences at the Middle East Technical University in Ankara, at the University of East Anglia, and Webster University, Geneva. He has been a Visiting NORAD Research Fellow at the Institute of Economics of the university of Oslo. His teaching and research activities have covered the areas of macroeconomics, finance, international monetary system, economic growth and development. He has published widely on these subjects and has acted as editor and referee for various academic journals.

Mark Le Gros Allen (1947) is Deputy Director of the Policy Development and Review Department of the IMF. He joined the IMF in 1974 and has successively held the positions of Economist in the Trade and Payments Division of the Exchange and Trade Relations Department, Economist in the Geneva Office, Advisor, mainly on debt issues, in the Exchange and Trade Relations Department, Division Chief, West Africa, of the African Department, Assistant Director, International Capital Markets, of the Exchange and Trade Relations Department, Senior Resident Representative of the IMF in Poland, Senior Advisor of the Policy Development and Review Department, working mainly on IMF surveillance policy, debt and financial crisis management issues, Senior Resident Representative of the IMF in Hungary, and finally Deputy Director of the Policy Development and Review Department.

Amar Bhattacharya (1952) is Senior Advisor, Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network at the World Bank. In this capacity, he is responsible for coordinating the Bank's work on international financial architecture. He was principal author of a policy research report on *Private Capital Flows to Developing Countries* and has authored several publications relating to the recent financial crisis. Since joining the Bank, he has a long standing involvement in the East Asia region, including as Division Chief for Country Operations, Indonesia, Papua New Guinea and the South Pacific. He was Chief Officer for Country Creditworthiness. Prior to joining the World Bank, he worked as an international economist at the First National Bank of Chicago.

Jack Boorman (1941) is the Director of the Policy Development and Review Department of the IMF. He was an advisor to Bank Indonesia and Resident Representative of the Fund in Indonesia. He has held successively senior positions at the Fund, including Division Chief for both the Asian and European Departments, Deputy Director of the Exchange and Trade Relations Department. He has lectured at both the Universities of Southern California and Maryland and has published on the topics of banking, macroeconomics, and monetary theory and policy.

Howard Brown (1952) is General Director, International Trade and Finance Branch of the Department of Finance in Canada. In this function he supervises and coordinates the Department's analytical work and activities in support of Canada's membership in the G-7, its chairmanship of the G-20 and its ongoing efforts to improve the international financial system more generally. Previously, he was Director, International Finance and Economic Analysis Division, and Assistant Director of the Fiscal Policy Division. Mr. Brown has also held other posts at the Department of Finance and at the Canadian Embassy in Washington, D.C. before joining the Department. He worked for two of Canada's "Big Five" commercial banks and for a New York-based consulting firm specialising in government policy reform in developing countries. He has worked in Jamaica, Indonesia and Ukraine as well as in North America.

Ariel Buira (1940) is Ambassador of Mexico in Greece. He was previously with the Central Bank of Mexico, as Advisor to the Director-General, Director of International Economic Research, Deputy Governor and member of the Board of Governors. At the International Monetary Fund he has been both a staff member and Executive Director. At the Institute of Technology of Monterrey he has lectured on Economic Analysis and was Director of the Master's Programme in Economics. At the Centre for Economic and Demographic Studies of El Colegio de México he was professor of Economic Theory. He has a wide range of publications on monetary policy, international economics, and the Mexican economy.

Stephany Griffith-Jones (1947) is Professor at the Institute of Development Studies at Sussex University and was until November 2000 Deputy Director, Economic Affairs Division at the Commonwealth Secretariat in London. She started her career in 1970 at the Central Bank of Chile. Before joining the Institute of Development Studies, she worked at

Barclays Bank International in the UK. She has led many research projects on debt and private capital flows, and has acted as Senior Consultant to governments in Eastern Europe and Latin America and to many international agencies, including the World Bank, the Inter-American Development Bank, the EU and UNCTAD. Professor Griffith-Jones has written widely on international finance and macroeconomic policies, especially in relation to Latin American and East European economies.

Louis Kasekende (1958) is Deputy Governor of the Bank of Uganda. He joined the Bank in 1986 and has held several positions, including at the Research Department as successively Senior Principal Banking Officer, Acting Assistant Director, Deputy Director and Director, and as Executive Director, Research and Policy Function. His teaching activities have included being Special Assistant at the Department of Economics of Makerere University, Tutor at the Department of Econometrics of the University of Manchester and Lecturer of the MA programme in Economic Policy and Planning at Makerere University. In the period 1992-1999 Mr. Kasekende was Board Member of the Economic Policy Research Centre. He has published several books and articles in local and international journals.

Guillermo Le Fort (1954) is Director of International Affairs and member of the advisory team to the Governor of the Central Bank of Chile in Macroeconomic and Financial Policy Matters. He is also Member of the Working Group on Capital Flows of the Financial Stability Forum. He acts asa Consultant to the International Monetary Fund in financial, monetary and exchange rate issues and is Professor of Monetary Theory at the Finis Terrae University and the Universidad de Chile. Previously he worked as Deputy Director of Research at the Central Bank of Chile, Bank Representative in the Trade Distortion Commission, and represented the Bank at the Board of the Chilean Copper Commission. He has held several positions at the IMF, including Senior Economist and Resident Representative in Uruguay, and at the Economics Department of the Universidad de Chile. Mr. Le Fort has acted as a consultant to many international and private organisations and has published in specialised journals.

Aziz Ali Mohammed (1928) is Advisor to the Chairman of the G-24. He started his career in 1951 in the Research Department of the State Bank of Pakistan. He joined the International Monetary Fund in 1960 and after serving in several departments, he retired from the staff as Director, External Relations in 1990. During this period, he took leave of absence to serve as Economic Advisor to the Government of Pakistan and as Chief

Advisor to the Governor of the Saudi Arabian Monetary Agency. He served as an Alternate Executive Director for the Middle Eastern constituency on the IMF Executive Board. He has been a consultant to the IMF, the World Bank, the Islamic Development Bank, UNCTAD and the Commonwealth Secretariat. He was the first Director of the G-24 Liaison Office at IMF headquarters. He has co-authored two books on the economy of Pakistan and has contributed to many academic journals.

José Antonio Ocampo (1952) is Secretary General of the UN-Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (ECLAC) since January 1998. Previously, he was Minister of Finance and Public Credit of Colombia, Director of the National Planning Department and Minister of Agriculture. He was a Senior Researcher and Member of the Board of Directors of FEDESAROLLO, Advisor to the Colombian Foreign Trade Board, Advisor to the Colombian Government on Coffee Affairs, National Director of the Employment Mission, and Director of the Center for Development Studies at the Universidad de los Andes. His academic activities have included being Professor of Economics at the Universidad de los Andes and Professor of Economic History of the Universidad Nacional de Colombia. He has been a Visiting Fellow at Oxford and Yale University. He is Member of the Editorial Board of several academic journals. In Colombia, he has been Member of the Public Expenditure Commissions, Member of the Advisory Commission for Fiscal Reform and Member of the Mission on Intergovernmental Finances. Previously, Mr. Ocampo was a Member of the Board of Directors of IDEMA (Agricultural Marketing Board of Colombia), of both COLMENA and CORPAVI Savings and Loan Banks, of the Colombian TELECOM, of the Social Savings Bank and of the Colmena Foundation for Popular Housing. He has also served as a consultant to the Inter-American Development Bank, the World Bank and the United Nations. He has published several books and many articles in academic journals.

Yung Chul Park (1939) is Professor of Economics at Korea University, and Chairman of the Board of the Korea Exchange Bank in Seoul, Korea. He previously served as the Chief Economic Adviser to President Doo Hwan Chun of Korea, as President of the Korea Development Institute, as President of the Korea Institute of Finance, and as a Member of the Bank of Korea's Monetary Board. He also was the Director of the Institute of Economic Research at Korea University, taught at Harvard University and Boston University as a Visiting Professor, and worked for the International Monetary Fund. From June to December 1998, he managed the merger of Korea's two largest commercial banks as Chairman of the CBK-Hanil Bank Merger Committee.

Wouter Raab (1955) is Director of Foreign Financial Relations at the Ministry of Finance of the Netherlands. His responsibilities include the formulation of Dutch policy on IMF and World Bank matters, reform of the international financial architecture, and European integration and EMU issues. He is an alternate member of the Economic and Financial Committee (EFC) in Brussels. He started his career at the Ministry for Social Affairs and Employment in 1982, where he was responsible for the design of several labour-market programmes. In 1987, he moved to the Ministry of Finance. He wrote and edited the policy chapters of the Government's annual Budget Memorandum ("Miljoenennota"). In 1991, he became head of the Multilateral Banks Division, where he represented the Netherlands in several negotiations on the replenishment of the softloan windows of these institutions. In 1996, he became head of the International Monetary Affairs Division. He was involved in the negotiations of the EU Growth and Stability Pact.

Maria Ramos (1959) is Director General of the Department of Finance of South Africa. She started at this Department in 1995, as Deputy Director General, Financial Planning. Ms. Ramos is also Director of the Development Bank of Southern Africa, Non-Executive Director of the Corporation for Public Deposits, and Non-Executive Director of the Financial Markets Advisory Board. Previously, she was Research Officer at the Centre for Research into Economics and Finance in Southern Africa at the London School of Economics, and Research Associate at the Centre for the Study of the South African Economy and International Finance, also at the London School of Economics. She was Economist at the Department of Economic Planning of the African National Congress, and Sectoral and International Economist at the First National Bank of South Africa. Her teaching activities included being Lecturer in Economics at the University of Witwatersrand and the University of South Africa.

Yunjong Wang (1962) is the Director of International Macroeconomics and Finance at the Korea Institute for International Economic Policy (KIEP). He is the managing editor of the *Journal of International Economic Policy* (in Korean) and a co-managing editor of forthcoming *Asian Economic Papers*. Since he joined the KIEP in 1993, he has served as a consultant in various task forces at the Korean Ministry of Finance. He has published over 30 books and numerous papers for academic journals.

William R. White (1943) is the Economic Adviser and Head of the Monetary and Economic Department of the Bank for International Settlements. In this function, one of his responsibilities is leading the

preparation of the BIS Annual Report. He has previously worked for the Bank of Canada as Economist and Deputy Chief with the Department of Banking and Financial Analysis, as Deputy Chief and then Chief of the Research Department, as appointed Adviser to the Governor and finally as the Bank's Deputy Governor. He has also worked as an Economist at the Bank of England.

Abbreviations

ADB APEC ASEAN BCBS BCCI BIS CCFF	Asian Development Bank Asia Pacific Economic Cooperation Association of Southeast Asian Nations Basel Committee on Banking Supervision Bank of Credit and Commerce International Bank for International Settlements Compensatory and Contingency Financing Facility (of the IMF)
CCL CFF CGFS CMR	Contingent Credit Line (of the IMF) Compensatory Financing Facility (of the IMF) Committee on the Global Financial System (of the BIS)
DCs	Capital Market Report (of the IMF) developing countries
EAC	East African Cooperation
ECLAC	Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (of the UN)
EFC	Economic and Financial Committee (of the EU)
EFF	Extended Fund Facility (of the IMF)
EMEs	emerging market economies
EMS	European Monetary System
EMU	Economic and Monetary Union
ERM	Exchange Rate Mechanism (of the EMS)
ESAF	Enhanced Structural Adjustment Facility (of the IMF)
EU	European Union
FDI	foreign direct investment
FSA	Financial Sector Assessment
FSAP	Financial Sector Assessment Program
FSF	Financial Stability Forum
FSSA	Financial Sector Stability Assessment
GATT	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
GDP	gross domestic product
HIPC	Highly Indebted Poor Countries
HKMA	Hong Kong Monetary Authority
HLIs	highly leveraged institutions
IASC	International Accounting Standards Committee
IAIS	International Association of Insurance Supervisors
IDRC	International Development Research Centre
IFIs	international financial institutions
ILO	International Labour Organization

IMF	International Monetary Fund
IMFC	International Monetary and Financial Committee (of the
	IMF)
IOSCO	International Organization of Securities Commissions
LOLR	Lender of Last Resort
LTCM	Long-Term Capital Management
MAC	Monetary Affairs Committee of the East African Coopera-
	tion
NAB	New Arrangements to Borrow (of the IMF)
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Agreement
NGO	non-governmental organisation
NPLs	non-performing loans
ODA	official development assistance
OECD	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
PRGF	Poverty Reduction and Growth Facility (of the IMF)
PRSP	Participatory Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers
ROSCs	Reports on the Observance of Standards and Codes (of the
	IMF)
S&P	Standard and Poor's
SBA	Stand-By Arrangement (of the IMF)
SDDS	Special Data Dissemination Standard (of the IMF)
SDR	special drawing right
SRF	Supplemental Reserve Facility (of the IMF)
UDROP	universal debt roll-over option with a penalty
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
UNCTAD	United Nations Conference on Trade and Development
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNU	United Nations University
URR	Unregulated Reserve Requirement
US	United States
WIDER	World Institute for Development Economics Research
WTO	World Trade Organization

Preface

In the current debate on international financial reform, efforts at bringing together Northern and Southern perspectives are rare. In general, the way the international system works seems to give predominance to the views from advanced rather than developing countries. Therefore, I most heartily accepted the invitation of FONDAD and IDRC to be involved in an initiative to bring together Northern and Southern perspectives on international financial reform – the so-called Global Financial Governance Initiative (GFGI) – and act, together with Jan Joost Teunissen, as a co-chair of GFGI's working group on "Crisis Prevention and Response".

In recent years, there have been a lot of interesting new initiatives and a growing literature on the subject. However, the agenda continues to be restricted and most of the fora lack vigorous representation from developing countries. This is not only true for fora that do not include developing countries or just include them by invitation – which is a very partial way of being included – but there is also an unbalanced representation from developing countries among those that do include them, such as the IMF International Monetary and Financial Committee.

As a consequence, in these fora a number of issues have not yet received adequate attention. Let me mention a few of them. First, there is the issue of the coherence of macroeconomic policies of leading industrialised countries and the distortions that a system based on purely national institutions can generate in this regard. Second, there is the issue of the role of regional institutions in the developing countries – both in development finance and the field of crisis prevention and management. Third, there is the issue of maintaining national autonomy in certain areas, given the incomplete nature of the existing or proposed international arrangements. In developing countries, for instance, it is strongly believed that capital account regulations and the choice of an exchange rate regime are areas where national autonomy should be maintained.

It is useful to make a distinction between the real systemic and global macroeconomic issues versus what I would call "centre-periphery issues" (I use this term for historical reasons but also for the lack of an adequate alternative). Most of the literature takes the perspective of the classical discussion of the "lender of last resort" versus the "moral hazard" debate in banking regulations, which is basically a discussion about market versus policy failures in the financial sector. Although this discussion is certainly

important, I would like to emphasise that the essence of centre-periphery issues is that there are basic asymmetries at the international level which are not captured in the ongoing debate.

First, shocks generally come from the centre in a context in which there is no such a thing as macroeconomic regulation and coordination at the world level. Moreover, when a crisis emerges, developing countries are supposed to respond in a pro-cyclical way, because "restoring confidence" generally implies the pursuance of pro-cyclical monetary and fiscal policies. Unfortunately, during boom periods the response is also likely to be pro-cyclical, because if authorities had to adjust during the crisis, they are unlikely to have any political support for applying anti-cyclical policies in order to save for the bad times that may come again.

Second, there is a large asymmetry in the development of domestic financial markets. Developing countries have to choose between currency and maturity mismatches. If they choose to not have foreign exchange risk and borrow nationally, they will have maturity mismatches because the domestic financial market normally lends on short-term maturities. If they choose instead to use international financial intermediation on a large scale, they will have foreign exchange mismatches. You may also prefer to eliminate those mismatches by adopting an international currency, but then you eliminate your macroeconomic flexibility as well. So you are trapped into having inefficient financial management of some sort. Solutions are always partial: you can solve one part of the problem, but you always keep another.

Third, there is an asymmetry in adjustment costs. Aside from the fact that developing countries usually have larger economic shocks as a proportion of GDP than industrial countries, their social safety nets are also less developed. As a result, economic and social shocks are larger in the periphery than in the centre.

An essential problem that we face in the developing world is the increase of risks that are incurred during periods of financial euphoria. These boom periods generally lead to risks that only later on, during a crisis, become apparent as a mix of debt crises, maturity mismatches and currency mismatches. The only way to address this problem is to go to the source of the distortion, which is international financial capital fluctuations.

Although a crucial part of the effort to reduce these fluctuations and prevent the outbreak of financial crisis lies in strengthening the global institutional framework – one of the important issues discussed in this book – developing countries also need to develop an adequate domestic policy response. The policy options available to them include: choosing an exchange rate regime that, together with capital account regulation, provides room for anti-cyclical monetary and financial policies; strengthening anti-cyclical prudential regulation and supervision; improving the debt profiles of both the private and the public sector; and applying adequate anti-cyclical fiscal policies.

The current "calm" phase in which emerging markets find themselves provides an excellent moment to examine ways to improve financial crisis prevention and management. It also offers the opportunity to broaden the reform agenda. In my view, the agenda should be broadened in at least three ways. First, it should go beyond the issues of financial crisis prevention and resolution to include those associated with development finance and the "ownership" of economic and, particularly, development policies. Second, it should consider not only the role of world institutions, but also of regional arrangements. Finally, developing countries, as major actors in the world economy and as frequent victims of crises, should play a larger role in the discussions about reforming the global financial system as well as in its governance.

José Antonio Ocampo

From: Reforming the International Financial System: Crisis Prevention and Response, FONDAD, December 2000, www.fondad.org